









The Hon. Gladys Berejiklian MP, Premier of NSW

Via online form: https://www.nsw.gov.au/premier-of-nsw/contact-premier

cc The Hon. Victor Michael Dominello MP, Minister for Customer Service

cc The Hon. David Elliot MP, Minister for Police

15 September 2021

Dear Premier

A call to address unjust COVID-19 fines

The organisations and individuals that have signed this open letter are concerned about the impact of COVID-19 fines on vulnerable people and communities in NSW.

We call on the Government to reduce the use of policing and fines to ensure compliance with public health orders and invest more heavily in non-punitive approaches.

Many communities in NSW are facing dire financial consequences as a result of the ongoing COVID-19 crisis. While fines are a common mechanism for enforcing the law, we are very concerned by the emphasis that has been placed on them as a means for securing compliance with public health orders. These new public health orders have been introduced and amended at a rapid pace. Their legal elements are complex and difficult to understand. This has inevitably resulted in confusion among some members of the public about their rights and responsibilities, with a disproportionate impact on vulnerable community groups.

People from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds who lack access to accurately translated and culturally appropriate health advice also risk being further disadvantaged.

The excessive use of fines against Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people and communities in NSW also has the potential to further entrench disadvantage and exacerbate negative relationships between Aboriginal communities and the police.

We urge the Government to reduce reliance on policing and fines as a predominant strategy for achieving compliance with COVID-19 public health orders.

We instead encourage greater investment in community education and engagement strategies, and enhanced social and economic measures to support communities already in crisis. This will engender greater trust in contract tracers and authorities enforcing public health advice.

We call on the Government to reduce the monetary amounts of COVID-19 fines.

The cost of COVID-19 fines are significant, especially compared to other fines. People experiencing disadvantage already suffering from the economic impact of COVID-19 risk being plunged further into debt. The appeals and financial hardship review processes

relating to fines are insufficient to address these concerns – they require an understanding of complex and changing legal rules, knowledge of the right to seek review, prompt action within tight timeframes and language and advocacy skills, which many people just don't have.

We call on the Government to review and revoke all fines erroneously imposed for lawful outdoor recreation.

We are concerned that many people have been incorrectly issued a \$1,000 or \$3,000 fine by NSW Police for undertaking lawful outdoor recreation activities including sitting in a park by themselves, or with one other person or household members, eating in an outdoor public space by themselves, or with one other person or household members, and sitting alone in a car.

The Public Health (COVID-19 Additional Restrictions for Delta Outbreak) Order allows for a person (excluding areas of concern) to leave their place of residence to undertake 'exercise or outdoor recreation' with one other person or members of the same household within a 5km radius or within their local government area. Up until the 12 August 2021, it also allowed those in areas of concern to undertake recreation within 5km of their place of residence. The NSW Government website states: 'Recreation includes outdoor leisure activities such as sitting for relaxation, or to eat, drink or read outdoors.'

We cannot fine our way out of the pandemic.

We need alternatives to the widespread use of fines to ensure compliance with the public health orders. This includes better social and economic support for struggling communities, more investment in community engagement and education and the distribution of culturally appropriate materials and messages. Such an approach will be more effective in building support for important public health measures that seek to protect our community.

Yours sincerely

Joanna Shulman Chief Executive Officer

Redfern Legal Centre

Nadine Miles

A/Chief Executive Officer

Aboriginal Legal Service (NSW/ACT) Ltd

Tim Leach
Executive Director

Community Legal Centres NSW

Jonathon Hunyor Chief Executive Officer

Public Interest Advocacy Centre

Signatories endorsing this letter

- 1. Nadine Miles, A/Chief Executive Officer, Aboriginal Legal Service (NSW/ACT) Ltd
- 2. Joanna Shulman, Chief Executive Officer, Redfern Legal Centre
- 3. Tim Leach, Executive Director, Community Legal Centres NSW
- 4. Jonathon Hunyor, Chief Executive Officer, Public Interest Advocacy Centre
- 5. Stephen Norrish QC
- 6. Usman Naveed, Solicitor, Aboriginal Legal Service (NSW/ACT)
- 7. Mark Patrick, Principal Solicitor, Australian Centre for Disability Law
- 8. Felicity Graham, Barrister, Black Chambers
- 9. Brinda Thanakrishnan, Team Manager, CBA
- 10. Arlia Fleming, Centre Director, Central Tablelands and Blue Mountains Community Legal Centre
- 11. Luke McNamara, Professor and Co-Director, Centre for Crime, Law and Justice, UNSW Sydney
- 12. Dr Annie Cossins, Honorary Professor, Centre for Crime, Law and Justice, UNSW Sydney
- 13. George (Kev) Dertadian, Senior Lecturer in Criminology, Centre for Crime, Law and Justice, UNSW Sydney
- 14. Jason Moore, PhD Candidate, Centre for Crime, Law and Justice, UNSW Sydney
- 15. Mehera San Roque, Associate Professor, Centre for Crime, Law and Justice, UNSW Sydney
- 16. Vicki Sentas, Senior Lecturer, Centre for Crime, Law and Justice, UNSW Sydney
- 17. Tamar Hopkins, PhD Student, Centre for Crime Law and Justice, UNSW Sydney
- 18. Kate Bonser, Graduate Lawyer, Chalk & Behrendt Lawyers and Consultants
- 19. Ingrid Rikkert, Regional Accreditation Coordinator, CLCNSW
- 20. Jill Hunter, Professor, Faculty of Law & Justice, UNSW Sydney
- 21. Julie Stubbs, Honorary Professor, Faculty of Law and Justice, UNSW Sydney
- 22. Jane Wangmann, Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Law, University of Technology Sydney
- 23. Dr Elyse Methven, Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Law, University of Technology Sydney
- 24. Thalia Anthony, Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Technology Sydney
- 25. Stacy Treloar, Chief Executive Officer, Far West Community Legal Centre & Warra Warra Legal Service
- 26. Julia Davis, Senior Policy & Communications Officer, Financial Rights Legal Cent
- 27. Mark Holden, Solicitor, Financial Rights Legal Centre
- 28. Larissa Baldwin, First Nations Justice Campaign Director, GetUp!
- 29. Belinda Lowe, Head of Strategic Communication, Grata Fund
- 30. Isabelle Reinecke, Founder and Executive Director, Grata Fund
- 31. Katherine McKernan, CEO, Homelessness NSW
- 32. Ruth Barson and Adrianne Walters, Legal Directors, Human Rights Law Centre
- 33. Debi Fisher, Acting Principal Lawyer, Hume Riverina Community Legal Service
- 34. Bronwyn Ambrogetti, Managing Solicitor, Hunter Community Legal Centre
- 35. Peter Stapleton, individual
- 36. Roslyn Cook, Centre Director, Inner City Legal Centre
- 37. Janene Cootes, Executive Officer, Intellectual Disability Rights Service
- 38. Chris Cunneen, Professor of Criminology, Jumbunna Institute for Indigenous Education and Research, UTS

Signatories (continued)

- 39. Alison Whittaker, Senior Researcher, Jumbunna Institute for Indigenous Education and Research, UTS
- 40. Chris Povey, CEO, Justice Connect
- 41. Angela Cheng, Solicitor, Legal Aid NSW
- 42. Robert Pelletier, Executive Officer, Macarthur Legal Centre
- 43. Lotus Rana, Mentoring and Transition Officer, Macquarie University
- 44. Vasili Maroulis, Managing Principal Solicitor, Marrickville Legal Centre
- 45. Justin Abi-Daher, Assistant Principal Solicitor, Marrickville Legal Centre
- 46. Bettina Cooper, Aboriginal Financial Counsellor, Mob Strong Debt Help Financial Rights Legal Centre
- 47. George Newhouse, CEO and Principal Solicitor, National Justice Project
- 48. Nicole Jenkins, Centre Manager, Northern Rivers Community Legal Centre
- 49. Peter O'Brien, Solicitor, O'Brien Criminal and Civil Solicitors
- 50. Elle Triantafillou, Solicitor, O'Brien Criminal and Civil Solicitors
- 51. Oliver Creagh, Paralegal, O'Brien Criminal and Civil Solicitors
- 52. Grace Gooley, Solicitor, Public Interest Advocacy Centre
- 53. Kamani, Lawyer (volunteer), Redfern Legal Centre
- 54. Joe Murphy, Client Intake Supervisor, Redfern Legal Centre
- 55. Luke Carr, Solicitor, Redfern Legal Centre
- 56. Sabina Wynn, General Manager, Seniors Rights Service
- 57. John Engeler, CEO, Shelter NSW
- 58. Justine O'Reilly, Principal Solicitor, Shoalcoast Community Legal Centre
- 59. Kathryn Grimshaw, Generalist and Law Reform Solicitor, Shoalcoast Community Legal Centre
- 60. Dr Ebony Birchall, Senior Associate, Slater and Gordon
- 61. Yvette Vignando, CEO, South West Sydney Legal Centre
- 62. Belinda Smith, Associate Professor, Sydney Law School
- 63. Ben Boer, Emeritus Professor, Sydney Law School
- 64. Jason Chin, Lecturer, Sydney Law School
- 65. Nicole Graham, Associate Dean (Education), Sydney Law School
- 66. Irene Wardle, Educator, Sydney University
- 67. Lynette Riley, Associate Professor, Sydney University
- 68. Mahmoud Al Rifai, Ethnocultural Officer, Sydney University Law Society
- 69. Wendy Hu, President, Sydney University Law Society Inc
- 70. Abigail Boyd MLC (Legislative Council), The Greens
- 71. Jenny Leong MP Member for Newtown, NSW Parliament, The Greens
- 72. Cate Faehrmann MLC (Legislative Council), The Greens
- 73. David Shoebridge MLC (Legislative Council), The Greens
- 74. Jamie Parker MP (Legislative Assembly), The Greens
- 75. Jenny Leong MP (Legislative Assembly), The Greens
- 76. Tamara Smith MP (Legislative Assembly), The Greens

Signatories (continued)

- 77. Jane Sanders, Principal Solicitor, The Shopfront Youth Legal Centre
- 78. Catherine Smyth, Lecturer, The University of Sydney
- 79. Joe Alvaro, The University of Sydney
- 80. Amanda Niland, Lecturer in early childhood education, University of Sydney
- 81. Dr Judith A Cashmore, Professor of Socio-legal Research and Policy, University of Sydney
- 82. Tanya Mitchell, Senior Lecturer, University of Sydney
- 83. Carolyn McKay, Senior research fellow, University of Sydney Law School
- 84. Louise Boon-Kuo, Senior Lecturer, University of Sydney Law School
- 85. Simon Rice, OAM, Kim Santow Chair of Law and Social Justice, University of Sydney Law School
- 86. Alex Steel, Professor of Law, UNSW
- 87. Eileen BaldryDVC EDI & Professor of CriminologyUNSW
- 88. Karen Daniels, PhD Candidate, UNSW CCLJ
- 89. Simone Rowe, Research Associate; PhD Candidate, UNSW; CCLJ
- 90. Julia Quilter, A/Prof, UOW
- 91. Katherine Biber, Professor of Law, UTS
- 92. Penny Crofts, Professor, UTS
- 93. Sophie Russell, PhD student, UTS Law
- 94. Patrick O'Callaghan, Principal Solicitor, Western NSW Community Legal Centre
- 95. Dr Jenni Whelan, Director, Western Sydney University Justice Clinic
- 96. Roger West, Director and Principal Consultant, WestWood Spice
- 97. Christine Robinson, Coordinator, Wirringa Baiya Aboriginal Women's Legal Centre
- 98. Amy Wright
- 99. Betty Luu
- 100.Clare Petre
- 101.Dr G Thanakrishnan
- 102.Ellen Dimanoski
- 103.Lauren Miles
- 104.Sinem Kirk
- 105.Timothy Rayner
- 106.Troy Moffat